THIRD REPORT TO THE MINISTER FOR PUBLIC EXPENDITURE & REFORM

2014 DEVELOPMENTS & TRENDS
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part 1

Foreword .................................................................................................................. 3
Executive Summary. ................................................................................................. 4
The Role of TLAC. .................................................................................................... 6
Developments in 2014 ............................................................................................. 7

Part 2

Statistics .................................................................................................................... 8
Trends ....................................................................................................................... 15
Considerations .......................................................................................................... 17

TLAC Role and Procedures .................................................................................... 19
Part 1: Foreword

This report is prepared for the Minister for Public Expenditure & Reform, Brendan Howlin, T.D.

On behalf of my colleagues, I am happy to present the Third Report of the reformed Top Level Appointments Committee (TLAC) for the period January – December 2014.

In 2014, TLAC experienced another busy year, with 24 competitions held.

A number of TLAC members retired during 2014, Mr. Tom Moran, Ms. Josephine Feehily and Mr. Martin Murphy. I would like to thank these colleagues sincerely for their dedicated efforts and significant contribution to the TLAC process.

I would also like to acknowledge the contribution and support of my other TLAC colleagues who continue to give generously of their time, energy and expertise in meeting the considerable demands of TLAC.

I would like to express my thanks to the staff of the Public Appointments Service for their professionalism and ongoing support of TLAC in the execution of its remit together with my appreciation of the dedicated service of Ann Higgins, Secretary to TLAC.

Finally, I would like to thank you, Minister, and your Department, for your continuing support for the work of TLAC.

Dr Dorothy Scally

TLAC Chair

July 2015
Executive Summary

In 2010, the Government established a policy of open recruitment from all sectors to the most senior Civil Service positions. In line with this policy, the structure of the Top Level Appointments Committee (TLAC) was reformed with a majority of external members, one of whom would be the Chair.

In 2014, TLAC undertook 24 recruitment campaigns for senior civil servants. From these campaigns, 22 appointments were made, 2 appointments being made from one campaign. TLAC were unable to make recommendations from 3 campaigns. Two posts were filled at Secretary General level and the remaining 20 were at Assistant Secretary General level.

Review of the data for campaigns completed in 2014 identified the following trends:

- There was a decrease in applications for TLAC posts; 699 applications were received for 24 campaigns in 2014 compared to 788 applications for 21 campaigns in 2013. Applications from civil servants also decreased in 2014 with only 31% of the overall number received from civil servants.

- Applications from candidates in the private sector increased from 36% in 2013 to 45% in 2014. This was due to a number of specialist posts which attracted considerable interest from the private sector.

- The number of appointments from outside the Civil Service remained at a similar level to the previous year. In 2013, 24% of appointments were from non Civil Service candidates; in 2014, 23% of appointments were from the public and the private sectors.

- Applications from women have increased this year to 27%. This is the highest proportion since 2010. Women also accounted for 27% of appointees.

- There was less mobility between departments in 2014. The proportion of successful candidates appointed to posts in their current department, or to an agency of that department, increased from 57% in 2013 to 60% in 2014.

- TLAC retained executive search services in addition to the PAS recruitment campaign for two specialist posts. In addition to retained search for these posts, many campaigns were supported by the Executive Search function of the Public Appointments Service. This was to ensure that the widest possible pool of suitable candidates was available for the most senior Civil Service positions.

For the future, a number of issues need to be considered:

- The decreasing number of applications from Civil Servants.
- The decrease in the number of appointees from private sector applicants.
- Whether any potential barriers in the recruitment, assessment, and selection processes exist.
- Whether senior executive pay levels in the Civil Service are a serious deterrent for some high quality private sector applicants.
- What steps could be taken to encourage a higher level of female representation at senior executive levels.
- The role of TLAC in a whole system leadership development and talent management strategy.
- An increase in the membership of TLAC as the time commitment for members is more extensive and demanding than initially envisaged.
The Role of TLAC

- The role of TLAC is to support the Government objective that the recruitment and selection process for the most senior Civil Service positions is accessible to the widest pool of qualified candidates from all sectors.
- TLAC identifies the best candidate(s) for each position and makes recommendations to the relevant Minister or Government as appropriate.
- TLAC operates under the Code of Practice of the Commission for Appointments in accordance with the principles of merit, consistency, accountability, probity, best practice and professional confidentiality.
- TLAC operates in an independent manner and strictly on the basis of open competition and merit.
- Subject to certain exceptions, TLAC deals with all posts at and above Assistant Secretary level or equivalent in the Civil Service.

Reformed TLAC Structure

The Top Level Appointments Committee is comprised of, (i) the Secretary General, Department of Public Expenditure and Reform; (ii) the Secretary General to the Government; (iii) two other senior civil servants appointed for three year terms and; (iv) five members from outside the Civil Service appointed for three year terms, one of whom is the chairperson.

TLAC Committee Members - 2014

- Dr Dorothy Scally, Professional Development Consultant (Chairperson);
- Mr Martin Murphy, Managing Director, Hewlett Packard Ireland;
- Mr Clive Brownlee, Praesta Ireland;
- Mr Kevin Empey, Head of Human Resources, Towers Watson.
- Ms. Jane Williams, Managing Partner, Sia Partners
- Mr Robert Watt, Secretary General, Department of Public Expenditure & Reform;
- Mr Martin Fraser, Secretary General to the Government;
- Mr Tom Moran, Secretary General, Department of Agriculture, Food & the Marine;
- Ms Josephine Feehily, Chairman, Office of the Revenue Commissioners.
The TLAC process, explained more fully in the Appendix to this Report, consists of:

- An initial recruitment and selection process by the Public Appointments Service in conjunction with TLAC (recruitment campaign, shortlisting, preliminary interviews).
- Interview of TLAC candidates by a TLAC panel.
- Recommendations to Minister/Government.

Developments during 2014

TLAC, in conjunction with the Public Appointments Service, continued to review its selection methodology in order to take account of developments in best practice in recruitment activity.

In 2014, the TLAC process was amended to strengthen the continuity between the shortlisting, preliminary, and final TLAC interviews. This has been achieved by the presence and support at final interviews of the PAS representative who managed the earlier stages of the process.

In addition, the time and format of the final interview has been adjusted to include a short presentation by candidates to the board, generally in relation to their vision for the role for which they had applied.
PART 2: 2014 Statistics

A. Breakdown of Candidate by Sector per Stage in the TLAC Process

In 2014, there was a decrease in applications for TLAC posts; 699 applications were received for 24 campaigns compared to 788 applications for 21 campaigns in 2013.

In 2013, 41% of applications were from civil servants; in 2014 there was a significant decrease to 31% of the overall number of applications received. The proportion of applications from the private sector increased from 36% in 2013 to 45% in 2014. Applications from the public sector increased by 1% to 24% in 2014.

TLAC % Applications Received by Sector

---

Refers to the date of the new TLAC commencing work, i.e. 18th July 2011
Shortlisting

In 2014, the percentage of applicants from the Civil Service who were shortlisted for the preliminary stage decreased to 55% from 68% in 2013.

The percentage from the Public Service and Private sector applicants represented in the shortlisted group increased in 2014. Applicants from the Public Service accounted for 24% of the shortlisted group, an increase from 14% in 2013. Private sector applicants increased their proportion of the shortlisted group from 17% in 2013 to 21% in 2014.
Preliminary Interview

At the preliminary interview stage, the proportion of applicants from the Civil Service who were successful at securing a final interview with TLAC was 73%. This is a 1% decrease on 2013. The proportion of public servants also decreased from 17% in 2013 to 14% in 2014. Private sector applicants increased in proportion from 9% in 2013 to 13% in 2014. It is clear that the proportion of both private sector and public sector applicants who proceed beyond the preliminary interview phase remains at a comparatively low level.

% Candidates Invited to Final Interview – by Sector

Successful at Final Interview

In 2014, the proportion of civil servants appointed from TLAC campaigns increased slightly to 77% from 76% in 2013. The proportion of public servants appointed increased from 10% in 2013 to 14% in 2014. Appointees from the private sector reduced to 9% from 14% in 2013.
The data for 2014 in the preceding tables, from percentages of applications received to percentages recommended for appointment, can be summarised as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% Applicants recommended for Appointment – by Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% Applicants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Servants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Servants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. Breakdown of Candidates by Gender per stage in TLAC Process

Gender Breakdown of Candidates

In 2014, there was an increase to 27% in the proportion of applications from females from 21% in 2013.

% TLAC Applications received – by Gender

Of the proportion of female applicants, numbers shortlisted increased from 24% in 2013 to 29% in 2014.

% Shortlisted for Preliminary Interview – by Gender
However, the proportion of females sent forward to TLAC for final interview decreased in 2014 to 26% from 30% in 2013.

Even though fewer female candidates were interviewed by TLAC in 2014, the proportion of female candidates successful at the final interview increased from 24% in 2013 to 27% in 2014.
C. Mobility: Percentage of TLAC appointments from Home Department or Agency

While the percentage of appointments from the home department/agency had been reducing in 2011 and 2012, there was a reversal of the downward trend in 2013. In 2014, we see this upward trend in successful 'internal' candidates continue, with 60% of the appointments being filled by candidates from the employing department/agency.
Trends

**A. Impact of Open Recruitment:**

Open recruitment is Government policy and the numbers of applicants from outside the Civil Service has increased substantially to 69% of the total number of applications received.

In 2014, 23% of candidates appointed by TLAC were from outside the Civil Service.

The number of appointments to TLAC level posts from outside of the Civil Service, i.e. Public and Private sector appointees, was 23% in 2014 and 24% in 2013 compared with 25% in 2012, 19% in 2011 and 18% in 2010.

The proportion of applications from outside the Civil Service increased in 2014 to 69% of overall applications from 59% in 2013.

In 2014, there was a slight decrease in the number of appointees from outside the Service, with 23% appointed in 2014 compared to 24% in 2013. The number of appointments of candidates from the Public sector has increased from a low of 5% in 2012 to 14% in 2014.

Appointment of candidates from the Private sector has reduced from a high point in 2012, when 21% were appointed, to 9% in 2014. On examination, it would appear that while the number of applications is encouraging in the context of a strategy of open recruitment, the quality of the applications is often not at the level to qualify the candidate for consideration. Anecdotally, it would seem a number of candidates are applying for roles at a level above their competence or experience.

There were no substantive appointments made in three TLAC Civil Service competitions in 2014: Secretary General for the Department of Justice and Equality, Deputy State Pathologist, and Head of Finance, Department of Health.
Following a downward trend in applications from women in recent years, 2014 showed a reversal of this with an increase to 27% of applications compared to 21% in 2013. Women also accounted for 27% of all appointments made in 2014. This, however, is below the proportion of females successful in the years preceding 2013.

C. Mobility:
Mobility between Government Departments is decreasing.

In 2014, a trend for decreasing mobility between government departments continued. In 2012, 47% of appointments were from the home department or an agency of the department; in 2013 this rose to 57% and, in 2014, 60% of appointments were from the employing department.
Considerations

In October 2014, the Government published its three-year action plan for the renewal of the Civil Service. The plan provides a framework and action plan to “strengthen capacity, capability, accountability and leadership throughout the Civil Service”. TLAC operates in this dynamic environment of a Civil Service engaged in a programme of reform and renewal. TLAC, through its work, seeks to respond to and support the requirement for enhanced leadership and management performance at the top levels of the Civil Service.

Recruitment activity for TLAC in 2014 has identified a number of issues for consideration:

- The reduction in numbers applying for senior executive opportunities in the Civil Service, particularly the decreasing number of applications from civil servants is a cause of concern. The reasons for the decrease should be examined.

- While applicants from the private sector increased in 2014, the proportion of private sector appointees decreased. This may be explained by numbers of private sector candidates applying at the ‘wrong level’, or that they were competing against stronger Civil or Public Service candidates in some of the particular posts for which they were considered.

- Nonetheless, it is important to be alert for any potential barriers in the recruitment, assessment and selection processes that may be preventing applicants, both within and outside the Civil Service, from achieving success.

- Another aspect that should be taken into account is that, as the economy improves, rewards in the private sector are increasing. Levels of pay for senior executive positions in the Civil Service may be proving a serious deterrent for some high quality private sector people from entering competitions, or from persisting with their initial applications.

- Applications from women have increased in 2014. This increase in female participation rates is welcomed. There is still, however, considerable movement required towards a satisfactory level of female representation at senior executive level.

- TLAC is in an exceptional position to gain an overview of the skills, competencies, and leadership potential among the cohort of senior management
level competitors presenting for interview. There is a potential role for the Committee to contribute to an evolving integrated leadership development and talent management strategy for the Public Service as a whole.

- The time commitment required from members of TLAC is proving to be more extensive and demanding than initially anticipated. For the future, consideration should be given to increasing the number of members on TLAC in order that the Committee can continue to carry out its role by providing a timely and effective service in the senior executive selection process for the Civil Service.
~ REVISED TLAC ROLE & PROCEDURES ~

Effective: 01-Jan-2013
1 Role of TLAC

The Top Level Appointments Committee (TLAC) was established in 1984. The Committee’s function is to recommend candidates to Ministers and Government for the most senior positions in the Civil Service – at Assistant Secretary level and upwards. By carrying out this function in an independent manner and by making its decisions strictly on the basis of the relative merit of the candidates for the positions concerned, TLAC aims to strengthen the management structure of the Civil Service, and to provide a means by which the best candidates can aspire to fulfilling their potential.

TLAC operates under the license and requirements of the Commission for Public Service Appointments.

- Government has a policy of open recruitment
- The role of TLAC is to support that and ensure that the recruitment and selection process for the most senior Civil Service posts is accessible to the widest pool of qualified candidates from all sectors.
- Subject to certain exceptions, TLAC deals with all posts at and above Assistant Secretary level or equivalent in the Civil Service.
- TLAC is to identify the best candidate for each vacancy and to make recommendations to the relevant Minister or Government as appropriate.
- TLAC operates to highest standards of probity and professional confidentiality.

In virtually every competition there are a number of very good candidates in addition to the successful candidate. Candidates should be aware that each person is judged on her/his suitability in the context of the particular post being filled and against the particular set of candidates who compete for that post.

TLAC also advises the Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform and the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform (DPER) on the effectiveness of appointments to senior positions in the Civil Service. DPER has policy responsibility for recruitment, promotion and human resources management and planning across the Civil Service. In conjunction with the relevant Department, DPER is responsible for approving which vacant or new positions are to be filled and the relevant job specification.
While this document is intended to give an overview of the TLAC process, TLAC is responsible for determining its own procedures and remit, subject to Government decisions as appropriate. The information in this document is therefore subject to change either generally or in relation to specific circumstances identified by TLAC as requiring adjustments in the usual procedures.

Since July 2011 TLAC comprises four Secretaries General and five external members appointed by the Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform of which one is Chairperson.

The current members are:

- Dr Dorothy Scally, Professional Development Consultant (Chairperson);
- Mr Martin Murphy, Managing Director, Hewlett Packard Ireland;
- Mr Clive Brownlee, Praesta Ireland;
- Mr Kevin Empey, Head of Human Resources, Tower Watson.
- Mr Robert Watt, Secretary General, Department of Public Expenditure & Reform;
- Mr Martin Fraser, Secretary General to the Government;
- Mr Tom Moran, Secretary General, Department of Agriculture, Food & the Marine;
- Ms Josephine Fehilly, Chairman, Office of the Revenue Commissioners.
- Ms. Jane Williams, Managing Partner, Sia Partners

Job Specification

Job specifications and person specifications setting out the requirements for the post are the responsibility of hiring department and DPER, with observations provided by TLAC members. At commencement of the recruitment campaign, these are provided to the Public Appointments Service (PAS) which manages the advertisement and preliminary recruitment process for TLAC. In advance of advertising the job, PAS engages with the Secretary General of the parent Department in an effort to ascertain the
key skills required for the role and to identify the current and critical issues within the organisation that would be of particular interest to potential candidates. These are summarised in a job specification that reflects the seniority and responsibility of the post and that it is open to applicants from all sectors.

3 Competencies

The key competencies below have been developed for use by TLAC and are clustered into main dimensions associated with effective performance at the most senior level of the civil service. These Competencies form the basis of interviews and TLAC’s assessment. Full details of the Assistant Secretary competency framework are available in the Advice Centre on the PAS website www.publicjobs.ie

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For Assistant Secretary level posts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Exemplifies Public Service Values</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delivery Focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinks Strategically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expertise &amp; Self Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For Secretary General level posts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Leadership</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishing Vision and Purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judgement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Drive for Results</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4 Information Booklet & Application

Presentation

Candidate information booklets are prepared by the PAS in conjunction with DPER and the hiring Department, with the objective of providing easily understandable details for potential applicants from all sectors. Potential applicants can access the PAS website, www.publicjobs.ie, for details of the job vacancy, the job title, the location, closing date for applications and a description of the purpose of the post. The Information Booklet provides further details such as the principal duties of the post, the key competencies for effective performance, eligibility requirements and the principal conditions of service. It also gives information on the selection process and attaches guidance notes on preparing a CV for the post.

Application

The application for TLAC posts includes: a comprehensive CV detailing posts held, salary, line reports, etc; a statement of the applicants’ track record of achievement and delivery, and how they meet the requirements of the post; a statement of how an applicant will meet the standard of the competencies for the post under consideration.

5 Advertising

The advertising of all posts is organised by the PAS. The job is generally advertised by placing notices in selected national newspapers, issuing job alerts by email and text message to those who have registered their interest in positions at this level on the PAS website, and directly notifying appropriate grades across Civil Service Departments as well as other Public Service Bodies and Associations.

In addition, having analysed the job and person requirements for the role, PAS seek out potential sources of candidates to create awareness of the job opportunity and what the role entails. Relevant opportunities via social media, professional bodies and associations
are used by PAS to widen the applicant pool by circulating job information and creating awareness of each campaign as appropriate.

A specialised unit within PAS supplements the advertising of positions with more targeted approaches to generate awareness and interest in TLAC level positions. Contact with potential candidates focuses on raising awareness of the campaign and the opportunity to participate in the process, along with all other candidates. It does not provide a commitment to an interview or any other guarantees to a candidate.

6 | Executive Search for Candidates

In order to ensure the widest senior level candidate pool is available for consideration, PAS in conjunction with TLAC, may arrange the support of retained Executive Search for all Secretary General positions, and by exception for specific Assistant Secretary General posts.

7 | Short-listing

The short listing process is carried out by a selection Board convened by PAS under an independent chair; it also includes a retired Secretary General, an independent person who is a subject matter expert for the post in hand, and a TLAC representative. This process is supported by a PAS representative who oversees the process and records the deliberations of the Board. The Secretary General of the hiring Department is in attendance in an observer role to provide a briefing and clarity on the specific post and the Department. The Board agrees proposed short listing criteria consistent with the scale, skills, track record and experience required for the post. These criteria are used to assess the candidates in a consistent manner based on the information contained in the application forms, CVs and covering letter/personal statement. Based on the information provided by the candidate the Board assesses candidates’ suitability and provides a short comment to support the assessment. The Board then compiles a report of the shortlisted
candidates going forward to the preliminary interview stage of the process. All candidates are notified accordingly.

8 Preliminary Interviews

Attendance

Preliminary interviews are usually conducted by the same selection Board that undertook the short listing process with the exception of the hiring Secretary General. A TLAC member participates for Secretary General Posts and by exception for specified Assistant Secretary General posts. The PAS prepares an interview guide for the role which is referenced by the selection board in conducting the preliminary interviews. A PAS representative is also in attendance for the purpose of ensuring that the interviews are conducted in a fair and consistent manner in accordance with PAS recruitment license and the Commission for Public Service Appointments code. The PAS representative also provides assistance and guidance to the Board and takes the official record of the process. The interview will explore each candidate’s CV, track record, competencies and probity in regard to the post under consideration. Based on the interview and documentation, the Preliminary Interview Board identifies those candidates who in the Board’s judgement are suitable for appointment to the post under consideration, generally to a maximum of 5 candidates.

Notification of candidates

The Preliminary Interview Board is asked for feedback comments for each candidate and these comments are recorded by the PAS representative. An outcome issues from PAS to candidates by telephone and/or email following each stage of the campaign, i.e. short listing and preliminary interviews.

In addition to this, PAS telephone unsuccessful candidates following preliminary interviews to advise them of the result and may gather feedback on the process. During these calls PAS may also discuss the selection process with candidates to assist them in critically evaluating their own performance.

Feedback, i.e. comments and assessment in relation to suitability for the role is available from PAS, on request from candidates.
Information flow from Preliminary Interview to TLAC

- For each candidate being sent forward for final interview, the Preliminary Interview Board are asked to summarise the reason the candidate is being sent forward as suitable for appointment to the post, areas of strengths or challenges, and if there are areas in which the Board feel the candidate should be subject to further probing.

- Candidates are also required to undertake psychometric testing, the results of which are shared with each candidate on request and the TLAC panel.

- The PAS application documentation for each candidate is provided to TLAC. At times, Chairpersons of preliminary interview Boards may be asked to brief TLAC prior to final interviews.

- The PAS will supply three referees per candidate to the TLAC panel in order to confirm the candidate’s track record of achievement, delivery and probity.

TLAC Interviews

Attendance

- All TLAC interviews are conducted by sub-panels of the Top Level Appointments Committee each comprising two Secretaries General, two external members and chaired by the TLAC Chairperson. The Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform gave an undertaking to ensure that there is adequate rotation among the members in the composition of boards.

Secretary General Role

- The retired or retiring Secretary General does not attend at their successors’ interview; he/she briefs the TLAC panel in advance of the interviews and attends the conclusion of TLAC deliberations.

- For Assistant Secretary General posts, the Secretary General of the Department for where the post exists will have the option to participate in the TLAC interview and the later deliberations.

- In the case of specialist posts, the TLAC may make special arrangements in conjunction with the PAS, by delegating the final interview to a specialist Board with TLAC participation or by adding a member from outside of TLAC to a final TLAC panel.
The TLAC task is to judge who best out of the number of appointable candidates before them should be recommended to the Minister/Government for a particular top level post.

For each interview panel the candidate will be met by the Chair and introduced to members. The interview begins with the candidate’s presentation. In advance of the interview candidates are provided with a relevant topic/question and allowed 8 -10 minutes to present on the topic. Questions and exploration with each candidate relate to criteria and competencies for this particular post; how the existing and emerging challenges for the Department in question can be addressed and key priorities delivered, as well as the candidate’s approach to issues such as strategic leadership, change and performance management. As the interview concludes, candidates will be asked if there is anything further they wish to say to the panel.

Each panel determines the nature of the questioning and whether 3, 4 or all 5 panel members should participate in questioning candidates.

Length of Interviews:

• Typically, TLAC interviews are 45 minutes in length; in some instances if the complexity of the post requires, this may be up to 60 minutes.

Number of candidates recommended

• TLAC will recommend one candidate for appointment to the relevant Minister in the case of posts below Secretary General Level; for Secretary General posts TLAC will recommend up to three names, in alphabetical order to the Government, of those candidates considered to be of the standard required for the post.

Notification of Candidates and Feedback

• All candidates are contacted by either a Secretary General member of TLAC or the TLAC Secretary with news of the outcome of their interview.

• TLAC also encourages unsuccessful candidates to seek verbal feedback from the Secretary General of the Department or the TLAC Chairperson. Such feedback can be helpful to candidates in understanding issues that arose or suggested improvements, and also highlight the person’s potential for future TLAC level competitions.
Support & Development of the Senior Public Service

The Department of Public Expenditure and Reform with the Senior Public Service carries out programmes of development for existing and newly appointed civil servants. These include: formal induction, coaching / mentoring support, management development, succession planning, etc. Such programmes and supports are of great benefit to new and serving senior Civil Servants in carrying out the standard of achievement needed in their roles.